

CHAPTER V

CONCLUSION & RECOMMENDATION

5.1. Conclusion

Motivating Deaf participation on city/society improvement efforts has always been a crucial issue for all the stakeholders whose work related with Deaf empowerment. There are 3 reasons which urge why Semarang Deaf adult need to have more pro-participatory initiative. First, Semarang Deaf graduates from SLB at averagely adult age (20 years old). After graduation, almost all of them will directly find job and engage more with Hearing community. Second, Deaf is a community with invisible disability because hearing is an invisible condition. Unless Deaf speak up, people will not realize they have deafness. This caused them to unintentionally being more marginalized. Third, the rise of BISINDO learners and exposure on Deaf world, are great momentum to stimulate Deaf participation.

It is essential for the government and general public to understand the best way to realize inclusive city for Deaf. For Deaf to be included and no longer marginalized, they have to lead the way. They have to contribute more in their own way and advocate how the city/society should be improved. The long time residency in Semarang City hint Deaf are deeply attached to this city. Resident who have been reside for a long period of time and already attached to the city must have concern on how the place can continuously be a satisfying living place for them. Those concern then motivate them to join the city/improvement efforts. Disability group like Deaf certainly have concern about their living place. There must be strategic approach to ensure Deaf commit on city/society improvement efforts.

A scenario to motivate Deaf participation through their attachment to the city they are living, is the answer. This research aimed to fulfill the need of understanding Deaf CPA and how it motivate their participation. This CPA research focus on positive emotional bond between Deaf community and their living place (*community place attachment/CPA*). Manzo & Perkins (2006) found community with deep CPA will be easily motivated on community participation. The finding of those CPA literature need to be tested wheather it can be applied on Deaf. Deaf are marginalized group in the city who experience linguistic discrimination throughout their life. Thus, Deaf CPA condition are different from CPA of other urbanist group, especially Hearing community. The goal of this study is to understand how to motivate Deaf participation using *community place attachment* (CPA). The output are Deaf CPA level, Deaf participation condition, Deaf CPA predictors, Deaf

CPA findings then finally Deaf CPA improvement scenario. *The Deaf CPA improvement scenario* will be useful for stakeholders who want to include Deaf participation in city improvement efforts and its community.

The long time residency of Semarang Deaf adult community indicate their deep place attachment. From the questionnaire and interview result, they are proven to be a deeply attached community to their hometown/living place, parents, and their longtime social circles (which mostly are fellow Deaf). All 36 Deaf adult respondents have positive perceptions about living in Semarang City. They love living in Semarang and have stated commitment to continue reside here. Their positive perception are mostly caused by realization that Semarang already become part of their identity (*place identity/PI*) and they are depend to this place (*place dependence/PD*).

The deep CPA level is followed by Deaf eagerness to participate in many events. Deaf prove they are a participative community either through formal or informal networks. GERKATIN Semarang, which is the legal Deaf organization in Semarang, are part of HiMIKS. HiMIKS is the designated body under DINSOS Semarang which act as umbrella for many disability groups. Semarang City government and HiMIKS perceive GERKATIN Semarang as very participative in planning and decision making, implementation, as well as benefits utilization. Despite the language barrier, Deaf respondents also stated they are participative in their neighbourhood events. They really want Deaf to be included and accommodated.

However, Deaf deep CPA and eagerness to participate did not make them very participative in city improvement effort. Their placation strategy through GERKATIN need improvement. Language barrier and lack of sign language interpreter always become big participation barrier for them. Because this barrier and their lack of inclusive pro-environmental initiative, Deaf which are not GERKATIN leaders only become attendees in many events. Government and general public have not truly recognize their power and voice in city improvement efforts. Therefore their deep place attachment and participative nature are not effective enough. Intervention scenario are needed. Stakeholders surely need a recommendation on how the deep Deaf CPA level effectively motivate their participation in city improvement efforts. The baseline for recommendation scenario is summarized in Deaf CPA Predictors Model.

The crucial finding of this Deaf CPA research is the Deaf CPA predictors. The Deaf CPA predictors are their CPA dimensions and the most concerning non demographic factors of each CPA dimension. This result is possible because the condition in Hearing community and Deaf community are different. CPA can also differs in different minority group and different disability group. Thus motivating more Deaf participation through CPA, should not focus on improving their demographic condition. Instead give full attention on how Deaf can sense the place better and improve their bond to place. The *Deaf CPA Predictors Model* summarized there are strong predictors and weak

predictors. The strongest Deaf CPA predictors are *place identity (PI)* and *place dependence (PD)*. Meanwhile, the weak predictors which need most intervention scenario are *place affect (PA)* and *place social bonding (PSB)*. Result are combined from *Deaf CPA Predictors Model*, interview which stated the current barrier of Deaf participation, and best practice Deaf participation scenario to produce *Deaf improvement scenario*.

5.2. Recommendation

The recommendation for this Deaf CPA research is *Deaf CPA Improvement Scenario*. If the CPA condition is improved and the barrier of participation is tackled, Deaf with deep CPA can contribute more on city improvement efforts. The continuous participation will become empowerment as people exercise their power and capacity to act (Cavalieri & Almeida, 2018). Therefore this *Deaf CPA improvement scenario* can be used as reference for all stakeholders of Deaf empowerment issue. The related stakeholders are GERKATIN, *Pusat Layanan Juru Bahasa Isyarat (PLJ) Indonesia*, sign language interpreters, governments, NGO, Deaf leaders and social movers.

The scenario focus on Deaf CPA dimensions as the predictors of Deaf CPA. The scenario spesifically focus on improving *place affect (PA)* and *place social bonding (PSB)* as the least affecting predictors. *PA* focus on the development of emotional ties to the place. Meanwhile *PSB* focus on how place facilitate interpersonal relationship and foster group-belonging. As describe in *Deaf CPA Predictors Model*, *PA* and *PSB* weakly correlated with the 2 strongest predictors which are *place identity (PI)* and *place dependence (PD)*. Improving *PA* and *PSB* condition give indirect positive effect on *PI* and *PD* as well. Therefore, the *Deaf CPA Improvement Scenario* will improve the overall condition in each Deaf CPA dimension. The improved CPA condition will motivate Deaf to contribute more on city improvement efforts. Below are the suggested scenario.

1) Grooming Deaf leadership

From Author observation and interview, grooming Deaf leadership is crucial to empower the entire Deaf community in the city. The head of GERKATIN or Deaf youth who lead Young Deaf community are representative of the entire Deaf community. They need to have good leadership skill so they can direct Deaf community to collaborate more with Hearing community on city improvement efforts. As stated in interview (W/DC/10), the problems with Semarang Deaf are they do not feel represented enough by GERKATIN management board. Some of them even stated resentment towards their unfair treatment. When Semarang Deaf Adult were asked which community have good Deaf leaders, they answered Solo and Malang Deaf community.

Solo Deaf and Malang Deaf are great example of community with good Deaf leadership who are supported by many opportunities for Deaf empowerment. From direct

observation, Author notice that Solo and Malang Deaf collaborated a lot with NGO, youth communities, and universities. They understand partnership with government took longer to be realized, have limited quota, and very procedural. Therefore most of their collaboration are not with government. All of those collaboration become their practice to better motivate Deaf empowerment in the city.

Solo Deaf have some prominent Deaf leaders in GERKATIN who understand about Deaf rights, history, and Deaf world. They are partnering with Hearing people who volunteer as sign language interpreters for GERKATIN Solo. The volunteers are grouping together in Deaf Volunteering Organization (DVO) Solo. This is how inclusive friendship flourish between Deaf and Hearing interpreters of DVO. GERKATIN also have long standing collaboration with NGO Kota Kita. Kota Kita uses participatory process to ensure inclusion of marginal community voices such as Deaf in city improvement efforts. The FGD and capacity building which GERKATIN Solo participated in Kota Kita events then enhanced their social capital. The improved leadership skill, knowledge and networks become useful capital for GERKATIN leaders to guide their own community.

Malang is the homebase of *Akar Tuli*, the well known young Deaf community in Indonesia. Malang Deaf can easily study at university. The majority of young Deaf who joined Akar Tuli are university student. They are mostly studied at Brawijaya University as it has *Center for Disability Studies and Services* (CDSS) or in Indonesian known as *Pusat Studi Layanan Disabilitas* (PSLD). Directly supervised by Vice Rector of Brawijaya University, PSLD manage both diffable student and the non-diffable student who apply as paid-volunteer. The existence of PSLD in university guaranteed access to support their learning and inclusive environment. The diffabled student also given many chances to immerse and self-actualize themselves on any beneficial university events. The existence of Akar Tuli and benefit of accessible higher education groom Malang young Deaf to have good leadership skill. Malang Deaf community which lead by Akar Tuli and GERKATIN Malang then enjoy collaboration with many parties from Hearing people, NGO, universities, until governments.

Effort to train Deaf leadership skill in Semarang need different approach. There is no NGO such as Kota Kita in Semarang. There is no university in Semarang which have PSLD. Almost all universities are not giving access to support learning for the current young Deaf students. They need to navigate the learning themselves. GERKATIN Semarang as Semarang Deaf leaders also rarely initiate formal advocacy for Deaf rights. However, GERKATIN Semarang can groom their leadership skill through their alliance with DINSOS (HiMIKS). DINSOS plans for Deaf empowerment need to be shifted. The continous focus on economical empowerment caused competition within Deaf to get the benefit. Meanwhile the Deaf

community need leaders who can initiate more collaboration and represent the needs of the entire community better. Therefore DINSOS/HiMIKS need to bridge partnership between GERKATIN and NGO to improve Deaf leadership, engagement and advocacy skill.

2) **Disrupting Young Deaf deep place attachment with empowerment**

This Deaf CPA research have some interesting findings which can be combined to produce CPA improvement scenario. First, Semarang Deaf have culture to reside for a very long time in Semarang. Second, young Deaf whose age between 20-30 years old attached deeper to their living place. According to interview result, Deaf in those age group are very participative because they love to travel and hang out a lot (W/YDA/12). Memories and experiences which people develop within the place caused them to attach deeper (Marcus, 1992; Moore & Graefe, 1994). Thus, the earlier Deaf trained to involve in city improvement efforts, the bigger possibility they will commit to involve again when they are older.

While the older Deaf are more focus to improve their financial, young Deaf need to be empowered more. Below are some suggested initiative to empower Semarang young Deaf:

a) The formation of an integrated Semarang young Deaf community

The current Semarang young Deaf should be educate with Deaf rights, urban issues which affect their life, advocacy, and how to collaborate with non-Deaf community. To properly educate them with those, it is important to note that the approach, needs and interests between Deaf adult and Young Deaf are different. The organization and community between the two age group need to be separated. Thus Deaf organization in national level have *GERKATIN Pusat* and *GERKATIN Kepemudaan* (for the young Deaf).

In some cities there are GERKATIN and one youth Deaf community. There are GERKATIN Malang and Akar Tuli in Malang, GERKATIN DIY and DAC Jogja, GERKATIN Pati and Decop Community. Meanwhile in Semarang, despite there are many young Deaf who close to each other, there is no specific organization/community which lead by young Deaf. Semarang Deaf only have GERKATIN Semarang which lead by Deaf adult and rarely accommodate the needs and beneficial activities for the young Deaf.

b) Continous engagement with Hearing people who attend GERKATIN BISINDO class

The most crucial communication barrier for Semarang Deaf is the lack of sign language interpreters. Although there are many Hearing people who attend GERKATIN sign language (BISINDO) class, there is no further engagement between GERKATIN and the graduates. Most of the graduates are young, meanwhile GERKATIN Semarang

members are mostly adult whose age above 30 years old. The age gap and awkwardness between young Hearing people and older Deaf make it harder for the friendship to flourish. Meanwhile the strong friendship need to happened so the Hearing people are comfortable and committed to be prospected as the next sign language interpreter.

The existence of specific Semarang young Deaf community are meant to provide platform for friendship between young Deaf ang young Hearing people. As young people loves to hang out a lot, many joint activities can be used to teach sign language and exchange learning. Akar Tuli Malang, DVO Solo, DAC Jogja, Decop Pati are mobilized by young Deaf who target young Hearing people to join their BISINDO class and movement. Once the young Deaf already have many prospected sign language interpreters, they can be asked to be interpreter for the adult in GERKATIN Semarang as well. Finally, Deaf adult and young Deaf can enjoy many activities together with their Hearing interpreters without worrying about communication access.

c) Partnership with youth community/organizations to enhance young Deaf leadership

As result of successfully tackled Deaf communication barrier, Deaf can participate in many city/society improvement events, either formal or informal events. However for Deaf long term commitment to participate on city improvement efforts, the current young Deaf need to be empowered. Young Deaf have the deepest place attachment, potential to reside longer, and easier to form strong friendship with young Hearing people who are prospected to be the next sign language interpreters. Therefore the Deaf CPA improvement scenario include plan for young Deaf to improve their leadership capacity through continuous participation and partnership.

Partnership between Semarang young Deaf and young Hearing people can easily happened if Deaf willing to initiate. There are a lot of youth community and leadership organizations in Semarang such as AIESEC Semarang, Akademi Berbagi (AKBER), Young on Top, Polyglot, etc. They have many beneficial activities which target public and wide networks. Therefore the partnership not only will motivate Deaf to participate more, it will also give benefits to Deaf community. The benefits are direct exposure for Deaf world and sign language, practice maintaining their cultural integrity as Deaf, self esteem boost, new acquaintances, experiences, exchange knowledge and improving their leadership quality. If the young Deaf already empowered and enjoy partnership, they will bridge the understanding about Deaf world for young Hearing people who will surely spread the knowledge and experiences to others. As result, the interest and offers to do collaborative activities will keep coming from Hearing people. Deaf will have many chances to participate in city and society improvement efforts.

3) **More collaborative activities to shift Deaf concern from ‘*what can I get from this city?*’ to ‘*what can I do to improve this place together with everyone?*’**

Although deeply attached to their living place, Deaf participation in city improvement effort are lacking. There need to be a lot of activities for Deaf to practice shifting their concern from ‘*what can I get from this city?*’ (*place dependence*) to ‘*what can I do to improve this place together with everyone?*’ (*place social bonding*). Literatures from Anton & Lawrence (2014) prove people who aware they live in a threatened place also become aware of their deep place attachment. Those awareness motivated them to do continuous pro environmental behavior. Thus, Semarang Deaf need to be continuously exposed and involved in the concerning situation of Semarang.

Collaborative activities between Deaf and Hearing people give beneficial impact. The activity trains Deaf to realize they are also responsible to improve their living place and its society. Deaf working alongside Hearing people who already familiar with the movement not only teach Deaf about advocacy. It also raise their sense of community as fellow Semarang urbanist. The collaboration become prove to public/government that Deaf are as eager as Hearing people to participate in city improvement issue. However, the activities should be easily joined by Deaf commoners and not continuously attend by GERKATIN.

A best practice activities from Jakarta which successfully adopted in Semarang in which Semarang Deaf have participated were *Semarang Barrier-Free Tourism*. *Semarang Barrier-Free Tourism* are inspired by *Jakarta Barrier-Free Tourism* (JBFT) should be a routine activity. The walking tour which aim to raise awareness about Deaf-friendly tourism and transportation was well received and got positive feedback. These initiative is joint collaboration between stakeholders from different background. The stakeholders are diffabled community, disability activists, tourism enthusiast, NGO, reporter, and government. The assessment and recommendation after the event are holistic and applicable. Therefore it should be a routine.

The initial movement for Semarang Barrier-Free Tourism already done at Old Town walking tour event held by NGO TelusuRI on October 2019. Together with non difable people, there were 13 diffable who joined the event. They are Deaf, blind people, and wheelchair users. Journalists, bloggers, Old Town conservators and tourguide also joined the walking tour. The assessment and recommendation was then relayed by TelusuRI, tour guide, and conservators to Semarang City government. There are interest from public and eagerness from diffable

people to join the event again. However, because the lack of sign language interpreters, the event can not be done routinely.

In the future, if there are a lot of prospected sign language interpreters, the Deaf and interpreters need to participate in a lot of activities. They should not attend Deaf-related event only or engage with fellow Deaf only. Certainly there are many activities and partners in Semarang which GERKATIN and young Deaf community can collaborate with. The more Deaf participate in city/society improvement efforts, their CPA condition will be improved as well. The improved CPA condition will increase Deaf awareness that they are also have equal rights and share similar responsibility as Semarang urbanists. Therefore, they will be more concern and willing to do more for Semarang as their living place.

4) General public exposure is the key to sustain any pro-participatory innitiative within Semarang Deaf community

A routine, publicize, inclusive pro-participatory initiative is strategic approach to continuously motivate Deaf participation in city improvement efforts. Pro-participatory innitiative which can be promote in social media and have general public exposure are being loved by Semarang Deaf community. This is because they desire to attend many inclusive event and want to proudly show their Deaf identity without worry. After those *Semarang Barrier Free Tourism* event, many Deaf attendees stated they love this kind of inclusive events and the public exposure. Because the event are being show off in their social media, other Deaf who did not attend also stated interest to participate in future events. Collaborative activities with young Hearing community/organization are also done not only to have mutual benefit but also to introduce Deaf world to the general public. These past 3 years, Deaf empowerment innitiative in all over Indonesia actually rely a lot on publication and mass movement. Therefore public exposure in every initiative is important. This approach will strategically show that Deaf can contribute to the city in their own way while also point out to the general public how this city should be more inclusive.