**CHAPTER IV**

**RESULTS AND DISCUSSION**

This research explored the teacher’s feedback and the children’s uptake and repair in EFL context. In the following chapter the researcher tries to describe in detail the results and the discussion of observation conducted in i-tutor.net Semarang.

**A. Results**

Table 4.1 displays the total number of student turns, along with the number of student turns with or without error and student turns followed or not followed by feedback. Of all student turns, 36% were with error (as seen in example (1) and (2)) and 64 % were without error (as seen in example (3) and (4)). Of all student turns with error, 84% were followed by feedback (as seen in example (5) and (6)) and of all student turns without error, 76% were followed by feedback (as seen in example (7) and (8)).

**Table 4.1**. Total student turns, turns with error, and turns without error

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| Student turns | n |
| Total | 618 |
| With error | 220 |
| Followed by feedback | 185 |
| Not followed by feedback | 35 |
| Without error | 398 |
| Followed by feedback | 301 |
| Not followed by feedback | 97 |

1. S: Zebra. (Initiation)

T: Ze, more zebra? Hahaha, do you think this is a zebra? (Feedback: Clarification Request)

S: *Lagi*. (Uptake) 🡪 **student turn with error**

T: This is not a zebra. (Feedback: Explicit Correction)

What do you think it is? (Feedback: Elicitation)

It has a very long long neck. Look at the neck. See. This animal has a very very long neck. (Feedback: Clue)

1. T: What about this? (Initiation)

S: <X> (Response) 🡪 **student turn with error**

T: Cheetah. (Feedback: Explicit Correction)

S: <X Chi chen X>. Uptake 🡪 **student turn with error**

T: Chi? (Feedback: Clarification Request)

S: Chi chen. (Uptake)

T: Chi chen? (laughing) (Feedback: Repetition)

What is chi chen? (laughing) (Feedback: Clarification Request)

Cheetah. (Feedback: Explicit Correction)

S: Cheetah. (Uptake)

1. T: Here’s one for you. Now what about *kuning*? What is *kuning* in English? (Initiation)

S: Yellow. (Response) 🡪 **student turn without error**

T: Yellow. (Feedback: Repetition)

1. T: OK. What color is this? (Initiation)

S: Orange. (Response)

T: Orange. (Feedback: Repetition)

Very good. (Feedback: Praise)

1. T: Haa. Bat, what do you know about bat? (Initiation)

S: Bat produce milk. (Response) **🡪 student turn with error, followed by feedback**

T: A bat produces milk, (Feedback: Recast)

yes, (Feedback: Form-related Comment)

1. S: The longest animal. (Initiation) **🡪 student turn with error, followed by feedback**

T: No, snake is not the longest animal. (Feedback: Explicit Correction)

Are you sure that snake is the longest animal? (Feedback: Clarification Request)

S: No. (Uptake)

1. S: That is. (Initiation) **🡪 student turn without error, followed by feedback**

T: Hm hm. (Feedback: Form-related Comment)

S: That is the flying mammal coma and then. (Uptake) **🡪 student turn without error, followed by feedback**

T: Hm hm coma (Feedback: Repetition)

and then, it is… (Feedback: Elicitation)

S: Rat. (Uptake)

1. S: And then bird, birds, beak not a beaks. (Initiation)

T: Aha good, (Feedback: Praise)

not a beaks, beaks (Feedback: Repetition)

Table 4.2 displays the number and percentage of learner uptake moves following feedback. The proportion of uptake moves containing repair was greater than those still need repair: 27% of teacher feedback moves led to immediate repair, whereas only 11% of teacher feedback moves did not lead to immediate repair. Topic continuation moves that immediately followed teacher feedback moves―with no attempt at or opportunity for uptake―occurred in great number, where they followed 15% of student turns with error and 47% without error.

**Table 4.2.** Number and percentage distribution of learner uptake moves following feedback

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| Move | n | % |
| Uptake |  |  |
| Repair | 172 | 27 |
| Needs repair | 72 | 11 |
| No uptake |  |  |
| Following turns with error | 93 | 15 |
| Following turns without error | 303 | 47 |

Table 4.3 and Graph 4.1 display the number and percentage distribution of each feedback type. Repetition comprised the largest proportion of feedback moves: 25%. The next highest proportion of feedback moves was attributed to form-related comment, which comprised 18%. It is interesting to note that explicit correction is relatively infrequent, comprising only 10% of all feedback moves.

**Table 4.3.** Number and percentage distribution of feedback types

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| Feedback type | n | % |
| Repetition | 165 | 25 |
| Form-related comment | 120 | 18 |
| Elicitation | 104 | 16 |
| Recasts | 96 | 15 |
| Explicit correction | 64 | 10 |
| Clarification request | 46 | 7 |
| Praise | 34 | 5 |
| Clue | 21 | 3 |

**Graph 4.1.**Percentage share of feedback types



As seen in Table 4.4, the proportion of uptake after elicitation accounting for twice as much uptake as recasts. Specifically, of all student uptake moves, 38% followed elicitation (example (9)), 19% followed recasts (example (10)), 14% followed clarification request (example (11)), 13% followed explicit correction (example (12)), 8% followed repetition (example (13)), 8% followed form-related comment (example (14)), 3% followed clue (example (15)), and no uptake followed praise.

1. T: What if I put the lion here? *Di bawah*. What is *di bawah*? (Initiation)

S: In. (Response)

T: Un? (Feedback: Elicitation)

S: In, in, in, in, in, in. UPTAKE **🡪 student uptake following elicitation**

1. T: Did she have any daddy? No. What about mommy? Is there any mommy there? No. What about this? It’s her uncle. Uncle. (Initiation)

S: Uncle is uncle is no mommy. (Response)

T: Not her mommy not her daddy this is her uncle. (Feedback: Recast)

S: He have a car. (Uptake) **🡪 student uptake following recast**

1. T: What about the cheetah? (Initiation)

S: Cheetah. (Response)

T: Where do you want to put the cheetah? Tell me where do you want to put the cheetah. (Initiation Bound)

S: In in tree. (Response)

T: In tree? (Feedback: Repetition)

Inside the tree? (Feedback: Recast)

No? (Feedback: Clarification Request)

S: Yeah. (Uptake) **🡪 student uptake following clarification request**

T: Where do you want to put the cheetah? [Is it] in the pond, on the ground or on the tree? (Feedback: Elicitation)

S: In tree. Ground. (Uptake)

T: On the ground? (Feedback: Recast)

Could you say on the ground? (Feedback: Elicitation)

S: On the ground. (Uptake)

T: OK. Here we go. (Feedback: Form-related Comment)

1. T: What is this? (Initiation)

S: (Silence) (Response)

T: This is a dragon. (Feedback: Explicit Correction)

S: And the mommy and the father. (Uptake) **🡪 student uptake following explicit correction**

1. S: Poision. (Initiation)

T: Poision. (Feedback: Repetition)

S: Poisin. (Uptake) **🡪 student uptake following repetition**

T: Poisin or poison? (Feedback: Elicitation)

S: Poisin. (Uptake)

T: Poisiion. (laughing). Shawn? Poishawn? Or poision? (Feedback: Elicitation)

S: Poishawn. (Uptake)

T: Poishawn? (Feedback: Repetition)

(Laughing) So, your (laughing) your name is Shawn. (Feedback: Form-related Comment)

S: Poison. (Uptake)

T: Poison, (Feedback: Repetition)

okay. (Feedback: Form-related Comment)

1. T: Could you read them all? From the title. (Initiation)

S: I like bats, spider. (Response)

T: Oops this one first the title first, no. (Initiation Bound)

S: African animals, I like bats, oh I like bats, spider, scorpion, birds snake, and black panther show. (Response)

T: (Laughing) (Feedback: Form-related Comment)

S: A bird has two beaks, birds also lay eggs, a scorpion has poison in the tail, a spider can build a web. (Uptake) **🡪 student uptake following form-related comment**

1. T: Without a because how many beaks? (Initiation)

S: Zero. (Response)

T: Zero! (Laughing) (Feedback: Repetition)

S: The beak, one one. (Uptake)

T: One, only one, (Feedback: Recast)

so, how did the bird open the mouth, er or open the beak if there is only one beak? It cannot open the beak if there is only one beak. (Feedback: Clue)

So, how many beaks are there? (Feedback: Elicitation)

S: Four. (Uptake)

T: Four beak for a bird, are you sure? (Feedback: Clarification Request)

S: (Laughing) (Uptake)

T: So, two on the front and two on the side? (Feedback: Clarification Request)

S: Yes. (Uptake)

T: How’s that? (Feedback: Elicitation)

It’s er, it looks like a monster or mutant or something. (Feedback: Clue)

S: And one from <X> like the the the. (Uptake) **🡪 student uptake following clue**

T: (Laughing) so, a bird, oh you should write it by yourself, it’s up to you. (Feedback: Comment)

**Table 4.4.** Number and percentage distribution of uptake moves after each feedback type

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| Uptake context | n | % |
| After repetition | 6 | 8 |
| After form-related comment | 6 | 8 |
| After elicitation | 27 | 38 |
| After recasts | 14 | 19 |
| After explicit correction | 9 | 13 |
| After clarification request | 10 | 14 |
| After praise | 0 | 0 |
| After clue | 2 | 3 |

As displayed in Table 4.5, of all repair moves, 30% followed elicitation (example (16)), 16% followed explicit correction (example (17)), 13% followed clarification request (example (18)), 12% followed repetition (example (19)), 13% followed form-related comment (example (20)), 9% followed recasts (example (21)), 6% followed clue (example (22)), and 2% followed praise (example (23)).

(16) T: Is it on a tree or in the pool? (Initiation)

S: Yeah. In the tree. (Response)

T: O on the tree? (Feedback: Recast)

Is it on? (Feedback: Clarification Request)

What is on? On. (Feedback: Elicitation)

S: On. (Uptake)

T: What is on? (Feedback: Elicitation)

S: Up. (Uptake) **🡪 student repair following elicitation**

T: Up. (Feedback: Repetition)

Yes. (Feedback: Form-related Comment)

On is up. (Feedback: Recast)

1. T: OK. What should I pick next? What should I pick next, Richelle? (Initiation)

S: In the <X> (Response)

T: Where should I put this? Miss D, c’mon, you give the order. You give the order. Where should I put this one? Is it on the table? Under the table? (Initiation Bound)

S: On the table. Under <X> (Response)

T: Or in your bag. (Feedback: Elicitation)

S: In your bag. (Uptake)

T: In my bag? (Feedback: Repetition)

You you should say in my bag. (Feedback: Explicit Correction)

S: In my bag. (Uptake) **🡪 student repair following explicit correction**

1. T: Oh, how many egg do you got in your bag? (Initiation)

S: One, two. (Response)

T: Two only? (Feedback: Clarification Request) **🡪 student repair following clarification request**

S: Three, four, five, six, seven, eight (Uptake)

T: Eight? (Feedback: Repetition)

Eight eggs? (Feedback: Recast)

1. T: Without a because how many beaks? (Initiation)

S: Zero. (Response)

T: Zero! (Laughing) (Feedback: Repetition)

S: The beak, one one. (Uptake) **🡪 student repair following repetition**

T: One, only one, (Feedback: Recast)

so, how did the bird open the mouth, er or open the beak if there is only one beak? It cannot open the beak if there is only one beak. (Feedback: Clue)

So, how many beaks are there?? (Feedback: Elicitation)

S: Four. (Uptake)

T: Four beak for a bird, are you sure? (Feedback: Clarification Request)

S: (Laughing) (Uptake)

T: So, two on the front and two on the side? (Feedback: Clarification Request)

S: Yes. (Uptake)

T: How’s that? (Feedback: Elicitation)

It’s er, it looks like a monster or mutant or something. (Feedback: Clue)

S: And one from <X> like the the the. (Uptake)

T: (Laughing) so, a bird, oh you should write it by yourself, it’s up to you. (Feedback: Comment)

(20) S: Poision. (Initiation)

T: Poision. (Feedback: Repetition)

S: Poisin. (Uptake)

T: Poisin or poison? (Feedback: Elicitation)

S: Poisin. (Uptake)

T: Poisiion, hehehe. Shawn? Poishawn? Or poision? (Feedback: Elicitation)

S: Poishawn. (Uptake)

T: Poishawn? (Feedback: Repetition)

(Laughing) So, your (laughing) your name is Shawn. (Feedback: Form-related Comment) **🡪 student repair following form-related comment**

S: Poison. (Uptake)

T: Poison, (Feedback: Repetition)

okay. (Feedback: Form-related Comment)

1. T: Oh where do you want to put the tree? On the ground ? (Initiation)

S: Yeah. (Response)

T: Is it on the ground or in the pond? (Initiation Bound)

S: In the ground. (Response)

T: On the ground? On? (Feedback: Recast)

S: On the ground. (Uptake) **🡪 student repair following recast**

1. T: What about Ariel? What Ariel wants to stab (laughing) on the prince? Put the knives on the prince? (Initiation)

S: But he. (Response)

T: But? (Feedback: Elicitation)

Oh my God! (Feedback: Clue)

S: The prince is not in here. (Uptake) **🡪 student repair following clue**

T: But the prince is not here. (Feedback: Recast)

1. T: How to spell orange? (Initiation)

S: O. (Response)

T: O. (Feedback: Repetition)

S: R. (Uptake)

T: R. (Feedback: Repetition)

Very good. (Feedback: Praise)

S: A. (Uptake) **🡪 student repair following praise**

T: Hm hm. (Feedback: Form-related Comment)

S: N. (Uptake)

T: Hm hm. (Feedback: Form-related Comment)

S: D. *Eh.*G. (Uptake)

T: G. (Feedback: Repetition)

S: G. (Uptake)

T: G. (Feedback: Repetition)

S: G. (Uptake)

T: OK. (Feedback: Form-related Comment)

S: A. (Uptake)

T: A? (Feedback: Repetition)

S: E e e. (Uptake)

T: E. (Feedback: Repetition)

(Laughing) Is this the color? (Feedback: Elicitation)

S: Yeah. (Uptake)

T: Yeah. (Feedback: Repetition)

OK. (Feedback: Form-related Comment)

The percentage distribution of uptake terms of its absence after each feedback type is displayed in Table 4.6. Of all no uptake moves, 36% followed repetition (example (24)), 23% followed form-related comment (example (25)), 16% followed recasts (example (26)), 8% followed explicit correction (example (27)), 7% followed praise (example (28)), 4% followed elicitation (example (29)), 3% after clarification request (example (30)), and 3% followed clue (example (31)).

**Table 4.5.** Number and percentage distribution of repair moves after each feedback type

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| Repair context | n | % |
| After repetition | 21 | 12 |
| After form-related comment | 20 | 12 |
| After elicitation | 51 | 30 |
| After recasts | 15 | 9 |
| After explicit correction | 27 | 16 |
| After clarification request | 22 | 13 |
| After praise | 4 | 2 |
| After clue | 10 | 6 |

**Table 4.6.** Number and percentage distribution of no uptake moves after each feedback type

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| No uptake context | n | % |
| After repetition | 141 | 36 |
| After form-related comment | 92 | 23 |
| After elicitation | 17 | 4 |
| After recasts | 62 | 16 |
| After explicit correction | 30 | 8 |
| After clarification request | 13 | 3 |
| After praise | 28 | 7 |
| After clue | 10 | 3 |

1. T: What color is this? (Initiation)

S: Green. (Response)

T: Green. (Repetition)

**🡪 no student uptake after repetition**

1. T: How to spell green? (Initiation)

S: G. (Response)

T: G. (Feedback: Repetition)

S: E. E. (Uptake)

T: Geen. (Feedback: Clue)

S: *Nggak.* (Uptake)

T: Green. (Feedback: Clue)

S: Green. Iya. (Uptake)

T: Green. (Feedback: Repetition)

S: Gi (gi) G (Uptake)

T: G. (Feedback: Explicit Correction)

S: R. (Uptake)

T: R. (Feedback: Repetition)

Yes. (Feeedback: Form-related Comment)

Very good. (Feedback: Praise) **🡪 no student uptake after form-related comment**

And then? (Feedback: Elicitation)

S: E. E. (Uptake)

T: Aha double e. (Feedback: Repetition)

And then? (Feedback: Elicitation)

S: N. (Uptake)

T: A? (Feedback: Clarification Request)

S: N. (Uptake)

T: Oh N. (Feedback: Repetition)

S: Aku N. (Uptake)

T: Hehehe. Is this one? (Feedback: Elicitation)

S: Yes. (Uptake)

T: Yeah. Hehehe. You got it there. (Feeedback: Form-related Comment)

(26) S: Mammal. (Initiation)

T: Mamm ooh your favorite animals are mammals. (Feedback: Recast)

Okay. (Feedback: Form-related Comment) **🡪 no student uptake after recast**

1. T: Do you still remember this animal? Do you still remember this animal, Richelle? (Initiation)

S: Yeah. (Response)

T: What animal is this? (Initiation Bound)

S: Zebra. (Response)

T: Can I give you a clue? (Feedback: Elicitation)

No. (Feedback: Explicit Correction)

This is zebra. Zebra has strippes. (Feedback: Clue) **🡪 no student uptake after explicit correction**

1. T: What if I put the scissors. (Initiation)

S: In. (Response)

T: Here. In my pocket? (Feedback: Recast)

Very good. (Feedback: Praise)

**🡪 no student uptake after praise**

1. T: Where where do you want to put? (Initiation)

S: (Sticking the fish in the pond) (Response)

T: Oh in the pond? (Feedback: Elicitation)

OK. (Feedback: Form-related Comment) **🡪 no student uptake after elicitation**

1. S: And the fish again. (Initiation)

T: Oh, one more fish? (Feedback: Elicitation)

S: I stick it. (Uptake)

T: Hm hm. (Feedback: Form-related Comment)

There? (Feedback: Clarification Request)

Okay. (Feedback: Form-related Comment) **🡪 no student uptake after clarification request**

Very good. (Feedback: Praise)

1. T: How many cousins are there? (Initiation)

S: One, two. (Response)

T: This is the toy! This is the toy. Ini mainannya Clara. This is the toy. This is Clara’s toys. And this is the cousin. (Feedback: Clue)

**🡪 no student uptake after clue**

Another way of analyzing these data is to display the percentage distribution of uptake terms of its presence (as repair or needs repair) or absence after each feedback type, as seen in Table 4.7. Elicitation accounted for the highest rate of uptake, with 82% of prompts leading to uptake and 54% of prompts leading to repair. The least rate of uptake was generated by praise, with 13% of prompts leading to uptake, while 88% of prompts leading to no uptake.

**Table 4.7.** Number and percentage distribution of learner uptake moves after feedback types

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | Rep. | | Form-related comm. | | El. | | Recasts | | Exp. corr. | | Clar. request | | Praise | | Clue | |
| Move | n | % | n | % | n | % | n | % | n | % | n | % | n | % | n | % |
| Uptake |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Repair | 21 | 12 | 20 | 17 | 51 | 54 | 15 | 16 | 27 | 41 | 22 | 49 | 4 | 13 | 10 | 45 |
| Needs repair | 6 | 4 | 6 | 5 | 27 | 28 | 14 | 15 | 9 | 14 | 10 | 22 | 0 | 0 | 2 | 9 |
| No uptake | 141 | 84 | 92 | 79 | 17 | 18 | 62 | 68 | 30 | 45 | 13 | 29 | 28 | 88 | 10 | 45 |

**B. Discussion**

To discuss the results pertaining to feedback, the two research questions are reviewed. The first research question asked what types of feedback mostly used by teacher. It was found that teacher used eight types of feedback: repetition, form-related comment, elicitation, recasts, explicit correction, clarification request, praise, and clue. Repetition constituted the greatest proportion of feedback (25%), followed by form-related comment (18%), elicitation (16%), recasts (15%), explicit correction (10%), clarification request (7%), praise (5%), and clue (3%).

The finding that repetition was the most frequent feedback type used by teacher does not fit current research in ELT, in that recasts were the most common feedback type.

In a repetition, the teacher repeats the ill-formed part of the student’s utterance, usually with a change in intonation. However, many of the repetitions found in the corpus did not fit perfectly the definition given. These forms were found in the corpus:

* Teacher repeated student’s correct answer without intonation change, as shown in examples (32)-(36) from the corpus:

(32) T: Oh, any other animals? (Initiation)

S: Lion. (Response)

T: **Lion. (Feedback: Repetition)**

Very good! (Feedback: Praise)

(33) T: Could you… could you tell me any other color? (Initiation)

S: Yellow. (Response)

T: **Yellow. (Feedback: Repetition)**

Okay. (Feedback: Form-related comment)

(34) T: Oh what animal is that? (Initiation)

S: Zebra. (Response)

T: **Zebra. (Feedback)**

(35) T: And then. Ooh. (Initiation)

S: And then. (Response)

T: Everything in her room is go round and round and round and then <X> in this circle. She move into circle. She she moves into circle the toys the soldier toys also move into circle. What about this? What is this? (Initiation Bound)

S: Mouse. (Response)

T: **Mouse. (Feedback: Repetition)**

(36) T: Now if I put the monkey here, it means ? (Initiation)

S On. (Response)

T: **On. (Feedback: Repetition)**

* Teacher repeated student’s correct answer with intonation change, as shown in examples (37)-(41) from the corpus:

1. T: What animal lives on a tree? (Initiation)

S: Monkey! (Response)

T: **Monkey? (Feedback: Repetition)**

1. T: What about this one? (Initiation)

S: It’s a fish. (Response)

T: **Fish? (Feedback: Repetition)**

1. T: Look at that. Under. Please say under first. Then you can <X>. (Initiation)

S: Under. (Response)

T: **Under! (Feedback: Repetition)**

1. T: Which one do you like? Is it rabbit? (Initiation)

S: Rabbit. (Response)

T: **Rabbit? (Feedback: Repetition)**

1. S: Coma. Scorpion. (Initiation)

T: **Scorpion? (Feedback: Repetition)**

Okay. (Feedback: Form-related Comment)

S: Scor pion. (Uptake)

* Teacher repeated student’s incorrect answer with intonation change, as shown in examples (42)-(46) from the corpus:

1. T: What is this? (Initiation)

S: Ariel. (Response)

T: **Ariel? (Feedback: Repetition)**

1. T: What is Ariel? (Initiation)

S: <X> (Response)

T: Hehehe. What is Ariel? (Initiation Bound)

S: Ariel is *ikan duyung.* (Response)

T: Ariel is *ikan duyung*? (Feedback: Repetition)

1. T: How to spell orange? (Initiation)

S: O. (Response)

T: O. (Feedback: Repetition)

S: R. (Uptake)

T: R. (Feedback: Repetition)

Very good. (Feedback: Praise)

S: A. (Uptake)

T: Hm hm. (Feedback: Form-related Comment)

S: N. (Uptake)

T: Hm hm. (Feedback: Form-related Comment)

S: D. *Eh.*G. (Uptake)

T: G. (Feedback: Repetition)

S: G. (Uptake)

T: G. (Feedback: Repetition)

S: G. (Uptake)

T: OK. (Feedback: Form-related Comment)

S: A. (Uptake)

T: **A? (Feedback: Repetition)**

S: E E E. (Uptake)

T: E. (Feedback: Repetition)

(Laughing) Is this the color? (Feedback: Elicitation)

S: Yeah. (Uptake)

T: Yeah. (Feedback: Repetition)

OK. (Feedback: Form-related Comment)

1. T: If only one? (Initiation)

S: Spier. (Response)

T: **Spier? (Feedback: Repetition)**

Spier or spider? (Feedback: Elicitation)

S: (Laughing) (Uptake)

1. T: Could you wait wait wait the first sentence. Could you read the second sentence until here? What’s your second sentence? A start from here a. (Initiation)

S: A process to bigs or to lay eggs. (Response)

T: The second one? (Elicitation)

S: A scorpion has a poison. (Uptake)

T: **A poison? (Feedback: Repetition)**

You can can you count poison? (Feedback: Elicitation)

S: Has poison. (Uptake)

T: Not has a poison, because we cannot count poison, has poison. (Feedback: Explicit Correction)

Form-related comments were the second most frequent feedback type used by teacher. As already defined, form-related comment refers to positive or negative response (not correction) to previous utterance. Examples (47)-(51) show form-related comments from the corpus.

1. T: How many pictures? (Initiation)

S: One. (Response)

T: **Yes. (Feedback: Form-related Comment)**

1. T: And then oh, what’s next? Fish? (Initiation)

S: Fish. (Response)

T: **OK. (Feedback: Form-related Comment)**

1. T: Which one is not the same, Richelle? (Initiation)

S: This the same, same, same, same, same, same, same, same. This is not. (Response)

T: **Hmm. (Feedback: Form-related Comment)**

1. T: What do you want to write about spider? (Initiation)

S: Spider has a web. (Response)

T: Hm spider. Oh can get web you mean? (Feedback: Clarification Request)

S: Spider. (Uptake)

T: Spider. You can continue here. (Feedback: Elicitation)

S: Can. (writing ‘can) (Uptake)

T: Build or make. (Feedback: Explicit Correction)

S: (Writing ‘build or make’) A web. (Uptake)

T: **Hm hm. (Feedback: Form-related Comment)**

Very good, Shawn! (Feedback: Praise)

1. T: You know black widow and tarantula? (Initiation)

S: Black widow, the small but the poisonous. (Response)

T: **Yeah. Hm that one. (Feedback: Form-related Comment)**

The next most frequent feedback type used by teacher was elicitation. There are three ways of eliciting the correct form from the students: teacher pauses and lets the student complete the utterance, teacher asks an open question, and teacher requests a reformulation of the ill-formed utterance. Example (52) shows an instance of teacher paused and let the student complete the utterance, in which the teacher elicited self-repair by pausing, expecting the student to provide the right lexical item.

(52) T: Now let’s put the monkey down there, it means? (Initiation)

S: On. (Response)

T: No, not on, (Feedback: Explicit Correction)

**but [un] un? (Feedback: Elicitation)**

S: [In] Under.

T: Der. Yes, very good Richelle this is under.(Feedback: Praise)

Examples (53) and (54) represent the elicitation technique in which teacher asked an open question. Example (55) represents the elicitation technique in which teacher asked an open question and a yes/no question.

1. T: <X> your capital. Hm hm. A bird has here. (Initiation)

S: Enough. Beak. (Response)

T: **How many beaks? (Feedback: Elicitation: open question)**

S: Two. (Uptake)

T: Two, (Feedback: Repetition)

you may write two here and the beaks here. (Feedback:

Explicit Correction)

S: Beaks beaks <X> (Uptake)

1. T: A snake also has? (Initiation)

S: Poison. Period. (Response)

T:  **In, in where? (Feedback: Elicitation)**

S: In the fang. (Uptake)

T: Aha! (Feedback: Form-related Comment)

1. S: Cheetah. (Initiation)

T: Cheetah. (Feedback: Repetition)

**Where do you want to put the cheetah? (Feedback: Elicitation)**

S: Wait. (Uptake)

T: **In the pond? (Feedback: Elicitation)**

S: No. (Uptake)

T: No? (Feedback: Repetition)

Recasts were the next most frequent feedback type used by teacher. In recasts, teacher reformulated student’s utterance (see examples (56)-(60)).

1. T: Clara’s playing with her favourite toy the soldier, the soldier but suddenly this bad cousin grab the toys and er what happen? (Initiation)

S: He naughty. (Response)

T: **He’s naughty. (Feedback: Recast)**

1. T: Which one is not the same? (Initiation)

S: This one are not the same. (Response)

T: **This one is not the same. (Feedback: Recast)**

S: This is not the same <X>. (Uptake)

1. S: This the table. (Initiation)

T: **Yes, this is the table. (Feedback: Recast)**

1. S: Has a sharp claws. (Initiation)

T: Yeah, it it has sharp claws so that it can climb the tree. **(Feedback: Recast)**

1. S: It can swim. (Initiation)

T: **Oh it can swim too, (Feedback: Recast)**

yeah, a walrus. (Feedback: Repetition)

Explicit correction was the next frequently used feedback type after recast. Unlike recast, explicit correction shows clear indication to the student that an utterance was ill-formed and also provides the correct form, as shown in example (61). Explicit correction was also done by providing the correct form directly, as shown in examples (62)-(65).

1. S: It’s the glue. (Initiation)

T: **Oh hehehe, no, not glue, clue. (Feedback: Explicit Correction)**

1. T: *Di bawah pohon*? (Initiation)

S: I. (Response)

T: **Under. (Feedback: Explicit correction)**

S: <X> (Uptake)

1. T: Now if I put that, oh look the monkey is on the tree but then the monkey is going down here. So now the monkey is under? Under? (Initiation)

S: Under. (Response)

T: **The tree. (Feedback: Explicit Correction)**

S: The tree. (Uptake)

1. T: Where do you put the story? (Initiation)

S: I take. (Response)

T: **Oh you have taken. (Feedback: Explicit Correction)**

Okay. (Feedback: Form-related Comment)

1. T: It. (Initiation)

S: Pro. (Response)

T: **Duce. Add an s. Produces. (Feedback: Explicit Correction)**

S: (Adding s) (Uptake)

T: Very good. (Feedback: Praise)

After explicit correction, the next frequently used feedback type was clarification request. In clarification request, teacher used certain phrases after learner errors to indicate that their utterance is ill-formed and that a reformulation was required, as shown in examples (66) and (67), although sometimes the phrases were simply to indicate that their utterance needed to be repeated or teacher required learner to be more certain of the utterance, as shown in example (68).

1. T: Is it in the pond or on the pond? (Initiation)

S: On the pond! (Response)

T: (Laughing) On the pond? (Feedback: Repetition)

**So you mean the fish is flying on the pond? (Feedback: Clarification Request)**

S: No! (Uptake)

T: No! (Feedback: Repetition)

1. T: Where do you want to stick the lion? (Initiation)

S: Stick it. (Response)

T: Is it under the tree or on the ground? (Initiation Bound)

S: Under. On the tree. (Response)

T: On the tree? (Feedback: Repetition)

S: On the ground. On the ground. (Uptake)

T: On the ground? (Feedback: Repetition)

**Where is it exactly? (Feedback: Clarification Request)**

S: In here. (Sticking the lion on the ground) (Uptake)

T: Here? (Feedback: Repetition)

Okay. (Feedback: Form-related Comment)

Very good! (Feedback: Praise)

1. T: Do you know what picture is this? What picture are these? What is this, Richelle? (Initiation)

S: Tree. (Response)

T: Tree? (Feedback: Repetition)

**This is a tree? Really? (Feedback: Clarification Request)**

S: Yeah. (Uptake)

The next frequently used feedback type was praise. Although the learners were young and praise was expected to occur frequently, surprisingly it did not. Examples (69)-(73) represent praise from the corpus.

1. T: What about… like this? Is it on or in? (Initiation)

S: On. (Response)

T: **Very good. (Feedback: Praise)**

1. T: What shape is this? Is this triangle or rectangle? (Initiation)

S: Rectangle. (Response)

T: **Yes, very good. (Feedback: Praise)**

This is a rectangle. (Feedback: Recasts)

1. T: Because a bat is a? (Initiation)

S: Mammal. (Response)

T: Mammal. (Feedback: Repetition)

**Very good, Shawn. (Feedback: Praise)**

1. T: Now the scissors is in my pocket. What if I put the tape, can I have your hand? Is this on the hand or in? (Initiation)

S: In. (Response)

T: In the hand? (Feedback: Recast)

S: In the hand. (Uptake)

T: Di atas? What is di atas? (Initiation Bound)

S: On. (Response)

T: **Yes, very good! (Feedback: Praise)**

On the hand. (Feedback: Recast)

1. T: Now what if I put the elephant this elephant picture, here? (Initiation)

S: In. (Response)

T: **Yeah! Very good! (Feedback: Praise)**

The least frequently used feedback type was clue. Lyster and Mori stated that in metalinguistic clue teacher provides comments or questions related to the well-formedness of the student’s utterance. Examples (78)-(82) show that clue is also a type of feedback that leads to student-generated repair.

(78) S: Zebra. (Initiation)

T: Ze-, more zebra? (Laughing). Do you think this is a zebra? (Feedback: Clarification Request)

S: *Lagi*. (Uptake)

T: This is not a zebra. (Feedback: Explicit Correction)

What do you think it is? (Feedback: Elicitation)

**It has a very long long neck. Look at the neck. See? This animal has a very very long neck. (Feedback: Clue)**

(79) T: How many cousins are there? (Initiation)

S: One, two. (Response)

T: **This is the toy. This is the toy. Ini mainannya Clara. This is the toy. This is Clara’s toys. And this is the cousin. (Feedback: Clue)**

How many cousins are there? (Initiation Bound)

(80) T: Ariel. A is it Ariel’s? Yeah. It’s Ariel’s. It’s Ariel’s castle. Look at the castle. See! INITIATION

S: Which the castle? RESPONSE/INITIATION

T: **This is the castle. [Here.] FEEDBACK: CLUE**

S: [Here.] UPTAKE

(81) T: What about Ariel? What Ariel wants to stab (laughing) on the prince? Put the knives on the prince? (Initiation)

S: But he. RESPONSE

T: But? (Feedback: Elicitation)

**Oh my God! (Feedback: Clue)**

S: The prince is not in here. (Uptake)

T: But the prince is not here. (Feedback: Recast)

(82) T: Read it again. (Initiation)

S : <X> (Response)

T: In there or in their? (Feedback: Elicitation)

S: There. (Uptake)

T: You mean, in their? (Feedback: Clarification Request)

S: T t h. (Uptake)

T: **Tail. (Feedback: Clue)**

S: T h. (Uptake)

T: T h. (Feedback: Repetition)

S: E r. (Uptake)

T: Only t h. Their. (Feedback: Explicit Correction)

How many? (Feedback: Elicitation)

**But you’re only talking about one scorpion. A scorpion. (Feedback: Clue)**

S: Yes. (Uptake)

T: If there is only one scorpion then you cannot use their because there is only one scorpion. (Feedback: Explicit Correction)

The second research question asked the effects of teachers feedback on young EFL learner uptake and repair, while the third asked the type of feedback teachers should give when teaching children. The feedback was considered effective if the student incorporated correction given by teacher either into their next utterance or at some point later in the class. The feedback was ineffective if the student had no opportunity for feedback incorporation or if they ignored correction given by teacher. In other word, the effectiveness of feedback was measured by its capability to elicit student uptake and repair. Therefore, teacher should give feedbacks that are considered effective.

As already mentioned, repetitions were the most frequently used feedback type and they occurred in three forms; teacher repeated student’s correct answer without intonation change, teacher repeated student’s correct answer with intonation change, and teacher repeated student’s incorrect answer with intonation change. Unfortunately repetitions only generated 16% uptake, in which 4% need repair, and 84% no uptake. It shows that repetition was not effective since it generated more no uptake moves than uptake moves, with or without repair. When the teacher repeated the learner’s correct answer without intonation change, the repetition did not show whether the answer was right or whether it was the answer expected by the teacher, as seen in example (83). This kinds of repetition were considered as unnecessary repetition.

(83) T: Could you show me a number of there? Is there any other plantation or any other oh…animal. (Initiation)

S Zebra. (Response)

T: **Oh zebra. (Feedback: Repetition)**

The above exchanges can be more effective if the teacher adds more comment, such as praise, which enables student to understand whether the answer was right or whether it was the answer expected by the teacher, as seen in example (84).

1. T: Oh any other animals? (Initiation)

S: Lion. (Response)

T: **Lion. (Feedback: Repetition)**

Very good! (Feedback: Praise)

When the teacher repeated the learner’s correct answer with intonation change (example (85)), it created confusion in student’s part because the teacher also used the same intonation change to repeat student’s incorrect answer (example (86)).

1. S: Frog! (Initiation)

T: **Frog? (Feedback: Repetition)**

1. T: What about, what about this one? (Initiation)

S: Glue! (Response)

T: **Glue? (Feedback: Repetition)**

You need glue? (Feedback: Clarification Request)

Levels of repair were relatively similar following form related comment, as the second most frequently used feedback type, with 22% for uptake and repair, and 79% no uptake. The form-related comments were given by the teacher mostly to indicate success in communication, therefore the result showing that percentage of no uptake moves following the feedback was high, was not surprising. Example (87) shows that form-related comment was received by the student as an acknowledgement that his utterance was correct. Example (88) show that form-related comment often served as an ending of an exchange.

1. T: Can you count? It’s too many? Too many, yes? (Initiation)

S: One two three. (Response)

T: **Hehehe, yeah. (Feedback: Form-related Comment)**

S: One, two, three, four, five, six, seven, eight, nine, ten, eleven, twelve. (Uptake)

1. T: Which one is not the same, Richelle? (Initiation)

S: This the same, same, same, same, same, same, same, same. This is not. (Response)

T: **Hmm. (Feedback: Form-related Comment)**

Elicitation accounted for the highest rate of uptake, with 82% of prompts leading to uptake, in which 54% with repair, and 18% of prompts leading to no uptake. When the teacher used elicitation to help the learners to notice their mistakes, the teacher tended to give them some time to reflect on where the error might be, encouraging them for self-repairing their utterances. This utterance was referred to as “designedly incomplete utterance” and it is a common way for language teachers to initiate students’ self-correction. In most instances, she gave them encouraging feedback, as a way to value every contribution in order to motivate learners to learn and participate in class (example 89). When the learner was not able to self-repair his sentence or when elicitation did not help the learner to notice how the utterance could be repaired, she explicitly corrected the mistake (example 90). When the learner was able to do self-repair, the teacher then repeated the correct version.

(89) T: What is a fish doing? (Initiation)

S: It’ a not running. (Response)

T: **Not running but? But the fish is? (Feedback: Elicitation)**

S: Swing. (Uptake)

T: **Swing or swim? (Feedback: Elicitation)**

S: Swim. (Uptake)

T: Yeah the fish. Can a fish swim? (Feedback: Elicitation)

Yeah. (Feedback: Form-Related Comment)

(90) T: On is up. What about this? This animal? It’s <X> (Initiation)

S: In. (Response)

T: In? (Feedback: Repetition)

In in in the tree? (Feedback: Recast)

No. (laughing) (Feedback: Explicit correction)

**A fish lives in a? (Feedback: Elicitation)**

Pond. (Feedback: Explicit Correction)

S: Pond. (Uptake)

T: Pond. (Feedback: Repetition)

Recasts, as the next frequently used feedback type, generated 31% uptake, in which 15% need repair, and 68% no uptake. Since recasts were mere reformulations of the learners’ utterances, they might not be noticed in the majority of times. Example (91) illustrated the learner’s reaction to recasts.

(91) T: Oh wait? And then, but, oh what happened to her leg? (Initiation)

S: He don’t have, he have leg. (Response)

T: **She has legs now? (Feedback: Recast)**

S: Yeah. (Uptake)

(92) T: Oh, because of the water? (Initiation)

S: Water is not bad. (Response)

T: **The water is not bad because the water can grow legs on her? (Feedback: Recast)**

S: Yeah. (Uptake)

T: **Can can make her legs grow? (Feedback: Recast)**

S: Yeah. (Uptake)

As seen in example (92) which is the continuation of example (91), when recasting grammatical features, the teacher tended not to encourage the learners to reprocess their output. She simply reformulated the sentence in order not to break the flow of the conversation.

Explicit correction generated 55% uptake, in which 41% with repair, and 45% no uptake. In explicit correction, the teacher supplied the correct form of an item, indicating the inaccuracy of a learner’s utterance, therefore it was easily understood by student and the student was able to repeat the correct form supplied by the teacher, as shown in example (93).

(93) T: OK. If I put the monkey down here, it means? (Initiation)

S: On. (Response)

**T: Under. (Feedback: Explicit Correction)**

R Under. (Uptake)

In explicit correction, the teacher was able to explicitly correct the problem by

suggesting a better way to reformulate student’s utterance, besides asking for his confirmation to check whether the correction has really been understood, as shown in example (94).

(94) T: Do you have any idea what are you going to write? (Initiation)

S: No. (Response)

T: No? (Feedback: Repetition)

**Not yet, not no, but not yet, right? (Feedback: Explicit Correction)**

Clarification request generated 71% uptake, in which 49% with repair, and 29% no uptake. The use of this strategy was very infrequent, but by requesting clarification the teacher contributed to the learners’ noticing that something was inaccurate in their utterance, as shown in example (95).

(95) T: Is it in the pond or on the pond? (Initiation)

S: On the pond! (Response)

T: (Laughing) On the pond? (Feedback: Repetition)

**So you mean the fish is flying on the pond? (Feedback: Clarification Request)**

S: No! (Uptake)

T: No! (Feedback: Repetition)

Sometimes, the teacher used clarification request as a strategy to check the learners’ certainty or understanding of their answer, as shown in example (96).

(96) T: What about tail? (Initiation)

S: One. (Response)

T: **One tail only? Not two? (Feedback: Clarification Request)**

S: No. (Uptake)

T: No. (Feedback: Repetition)

Praise generated 13% uptake and 88% no uptake. This type of feedback was infrequent in use, this is surprising since the learners were very young and praise was expected to be used often. In most instances, the teacher used verbal praise “very good” to reward good work and correct answers (example (97) and (98)).

(97) T: Oh any other animals? (Initiation)

S: Lion. (Response)

T: Lion. (Repetition)

**Very good! (Feedback: Praise)**

(98) T: Now what if I put the elephant, this elephant picture, here? (Initiation)

S: In. (Response)

T: **Yeah! Very good! (Feedback: Praise)**

These complimentary words were addressed as a strategy to motivate students to contribute more and better. However, given the minimal role praise appeared to have played in student’s uptake, it is recommended to avoid praising students merely for the fact of doing so. General praises were just like exclamatory words and lost their significance, while genuine and deserved praise is certainly warranted on the appropriate occasion. In order to achieve maximal role of praise, the teacher could increase constructive and meaningful feedback while decreasing general complimentary evaluations.

Clue generated 54% uptake and 45% no uptake. This type of feedback was infrequent in use and students often failed to get a clue from teacher’s feedback, as seen in examples (99) and (100).

(99) T: How many cousins are there? (Initiation)

S: One, two. (Response)

T: **This is the toy! This is the toy. Ini mainannya Clara. This is the toy. This is Clara’s toys. And this is the cousin. (Feedback: Clue)**

(100) S: He have a father. (Initiation)

T: **This is not her father. This is her uncle. (Feedback: Clue)**

He has no mommy he has no daddy. (Feedback: Recast)

But he, she has? She has, wait. (Feedback: Elicitation)

The number, percentage distribution and effectiveness of each feedback type is displayed in Table 4.8. Of all feedback types, only three were considered as effective. They were elicitation, explicit correction, and clarification request. These three feedback types were considered effective because they generated more uptake and repair than no uptake moves.

**Table 4.8.** Number, percentage distribution and effectiveness of each feedback types

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| No | Feedback type | n | % | | effectiveness | | | |
| + | | - | |
| 1 | Repetition | 165 | 25 |  | | √ | |
| 2 | Form-related comment | 120 | 18 |  | | √ | |
| 3 | Elicitation | 104 | 16 | √ | |  | |
| 4 | Recasts | 96 | 15 |  | | √ | |
| 5 | Explicit correction | 64 | 10 | √ | |  | |
| 6 | Clarification request | 46 | 7 | √ | |  | |
| 7 | Praise | 34 | 5 |  | | √ | |
| 8 | Clue | 21 | 3 |  | | √ | |

Elicitation and explicit correction, which were explicit types of feedback, were more effective than the other types of feedback, which were implicit. Elicitation and explicit correction indicate the locus and nature of the error, thus students can notice the existence of the errors and/or revise their utterances accordingly. On the contrary, implicit types of feedback, provided often in the form of recasts, was less beneficial as it involved students in a lot of guesswork of the erroneous part. Although repetitions were identified to be the most frequently used technique, they resulted in uptake much less frequently than did other feedback. Moreover, elicitations and clarification request were much more effective in eliciting student-generated repair, i.e. corrected forms from learners as they allowed for negotiation of form and offered students an opportunity to self-correct.

Regarding the Initiation-Response-Feedback pattern, the data showed that most of the interaction followed tightly-framed participation pattern or teacher-centered, in which teacher initiated topics usually in the form of questions whose answers were known to her with the purpose of checking students’ mastery of what had been taught. Students were expected to display what they have learnt when asked to. Their display of knowledge was then evaluated by the teacher. Through this exchange sequence teachers not only control the direction and content of classroom discourse but also forms of student participation. By initiating the sequence, teacher had the exclusive right to organize lessons, starting or continue with a new topic whenever she wanted and nominating turns, e.g. whose turn it was to speak, when a student could have a turn. This pattern of interaction did not give a lot of opportunities for students to initiate or to respond to a feedback given by the teacher.